

Effectiveness of Training Program in Movenpick Resort & Spa Jimbaran: An Evaluative Study

I Gusti Ayu Putu Wita Indrayani^{1*}, Komang Ari Herlia Listianti²

^{1,2}Politeknik Pariwisata Bali (Bali Tourism Polytechnic)

Jalan Dharmawangsa Kampial, Nusa Dua 80363, Kuta Selatan, Bali, Indonesia

*Corresponding author: wita.indrayani@ppb.ac.id

Abstract

Training is one area of Talent Management practice which is implemented in most organizations and has been shown to improve service quality in 5-star hotels. Nevertheless, assessment of training programs is rarely undertaken in real-world situations. The purpose of this research is to assess the effectiveness of the training program using Kirkpatrick's theory and model. To achieve the purpose, this research adopted mixed method analysis through survey design using questionnaires and validated through in-depth interviews with Talent and Culture Manager. Implementing stratified proportioned sampling from 307 employees, the sample of this research is 75 employees representing all departments. The results indicate that the training program incorporates Kirkpatrick's theory of training effectiveness into good scores and is provided with a range of strategies to perpetually establish an effective training program. The findings of this study contribute to providing an overview of hotel and Talent & Culture management in order to emphasize the basics of an effective training program and its evaluation for the quality of hotel success. It also contributes to literature by expanding on how to assess the training program in the hotel and what practical features should be addressed.

Keywords

evaluation; kirkpatrick's model; training; hospitality

Article History

Received:

May, 2022

Revised:

June, 2022

Accepted:

June, 2022

DOI

[https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.52352/ijarthy.v1i1.809)

[org/10.52352/](https://doi.org/10.52352/ijarthy.v1i1.809)

[jarthy.v1i1.809](https://doi.org/10.52352/ijarthy.v1i1.809)

1. INTRODUCTION

Training and development, as one of its aspects, seem to be a necessity to be applied in hotel organizations to be able to continue improving the quality of the services offered. As stated in Ahammad (2013), p.4, the quality

of service depends on the quality of employees. It is all about competencies, which lead to the survival and development of hotels. According to the research conducted by Al-Raggad (2017), the quality of training reflects positively on improving the quality of hotel services in 5-star hotels. Movenpick Resort and Spa Jimbaran, as one of the five-star hotels in Bali, is also expected to compete with other similar hotels. Seeing that the competitive environment is in line with the increasing number of accommodations, making competition harder, Movenpick Resort and Spa Jimbaran must carefully pay attention to the quality of its services, and training is one of the ways.

Table 1. Training Hours Report

Department	General Training	Dept Training	External Training	Accor Academie Training	Total Training
Administration & General	66	0	12	32	110
Talent & Culture	408	27	32	96	563
Sales & Marketing	250.5	148	0	160	558.5
Revenue & Reservation	141	246	36	0	423
Finance	366.5	296	48.5	16	727
Front Office	1298.5	2090.52	163	32	3584.02
Housekeeping	968.5	5800	45	16	6829.5
Recreation & Activity	655	967.75	39	16	1677.75
F & B Service	1455	2589	52.5	32	4128.5
Culinary	806.5	2145.95	0	32	2984.45
Above Eleven	840	1943.95	4.5	0	2788.45
Engineering	340	906.41	0	0	1246.41
Security	272.5	322	0	16	610.5
Total Hours	7868	17482.58	432.5	448	26231.08
Percentage	29.99%	66.65%	1.65%	1.71%	100%

The hotel reaches 26.231 hours of training, indicates a significant investment of time, resource and cost. Movenpick Resort and Spa Jimbaran held many training activities during a year to enhance the performance of their talents which categorized into Generic training, Departmental training, External training and ACCOR Academie. The most influencing training activity is Departmental Training, as the closest supervisor of the staff performance who knows most assuredly what area to be improved. However, with those heavy investment, any bad reviews and bad guest’s experiences still occur due

to staff's lacking of skill, knowledge, and attitude, also hotel's service quality. It indicates there is something lacking and becomes problem on the training program.

The hotel performs a simple evaluation model which highlight the assessment on skill, knowledge, and attitude of employee and had never done a special evaluation basing on employee's satisfaction. It leads to a condition which relevant action to improve the training is not possible to be taken since it is not clear how the training is lacking or good. Whereas theoretically, according to Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick (2007, p.10), evaluation after conducting training is one requirement of effective training program. There are four types of evaluation to be conducted, namely reaction, learning, behavior, and result. Evaluation of learning, behavior, and results are easily seen through employee performance appraisal, while reactions cannot be seen from there. This relates to the level of employee satisfaction with training program provided by management. Through feedback from employees after participating the training program and their assessment for the training implementation can be used as input and a reflection for management to create effective training program.

As the basis of this research, the main theoretical framework used is Kirkpatrick's theory of Training Effective and 4-Level of Evaluation Model. Kirkpatrick's theory is used as the theory provide holistic scope and reaches every aspect of effective training. Also, this is a well-known theory that provides four levels of evaluation where there is so many researches are based on this theory. Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick (2007, p.3) identified ten requirements for an effective training program. This mainly highlights on tailoring the program based on participant's need, setting learning objectives, right scheduling, selection of right place and right amenities, invite right people, select effective instructors, use effective techniques and aids, accomplish the program objectives, satisfy the participants, and evaluate the program. Furthermore, Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick (2007, p.11) stated the evaluation process is conducted through the "four-level model", which consists of reaction, learning, behavior, and result. Therefore, this study focuses explicitly on level 1 evaluation (reaction) by combining 10 requirements of effective training, as an objective to measure participants' satisfaction with the training program being held. Hence, this study will be perfecting the whole evaluation process that has practiced by Movenpick Resort and Spa Jimbaran.

Two reasons the Reaction sheet important are to know how trainees feel about the program and the effectiveness of the program to make necessary changes (Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick, 2007, p.24). The positive reaction left from a training creates psychological states in employees who tend to be ready

to transfer learning into operational practices and can reduce deviant behavior (Mansour et al., 2017, p.10). Satisfaction with training program creates employee commitment to the organization and work as the ultimate goal of training investment, encourages skills and knowledge, and as a result of the cost-benefits of training activities. Hence, the risk related to training program such as lack of transfer learning, absenteeism, etc. reduces if the participants satisfied.

Through this evaluation model can measure the effectiveness of training programs. The effectiveness of training is a major and crucial impact on employee performance (Ahmad, and Adamu, 2014, p.243). Even effective training helps organizations achieve their strategic goals and create competitive advantage (Devi, and Shaik, 2012, p.730). This leads to a condition that evaluating the effectiveness of training program becomes important to be carried out to see the extent to which training objectives and its return of investment have been met. Concerning the problem occurred, it is necessary for Movenpick Resort and Spa Jimbaran to evaluate the effectiveness of training program from the employee satisfaction point of view.

Many researches have done related the evaluation of training program. First was done by Ho et al. (2016, p.184), which mainly discussed the practices and perceptions of hotel managers in training evaluation. Second was conducted by Khalaf et al. (2016, p.92), which mainly discussed the criteria of effective training in five-star hotels and identify the significant impact of effective training on skills of the staff, the performance of the staff, the productivity of the staff and cost reduction. Third is a comparative study in Ghana that was done by Acquaful et al. (2016, p.179), mainly discussed the training and development practices in Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology (KNUST) and Social Security and National Insurance Trust (SSNIT) Guest House and the problems and challenges in it, evaluate the relative importance of the various training systems and examine how training and development impact productivity in the guest house. This research will use a similar design to ones done by Ho et al. (2016), Khalaf et al. (2016), and Acquaful et al. (2016). However, unlike the previous researches mentioned, this research will mainly discuss about the evaluation of training with the updated theory of Kirkpatrick (2007) about four-level of evaluation. This also focus on evaluating the reaction of employee towards training program with theory by Kirkpatrick (2007) about ten requirements of an effective training program. As mentioned earlier, this study used mixed methods approaches as done by Ho, et al. (2016).

This research is aimed to analyze the effectiveness of training program held for employees of Movenpick Resort and Spa Jimbaran, based on the criteria set by Kirkpatrick (2007) and to find out strategy could be performed

to continuously establish an effective training program. This study focuses on evaluating the training program that has been held in 2019, particularly on the departmental training program due to 67% of training program are held by the respective department. Evaluation is conducted by doing survey (questionnaire) and interview, which then followed by analyzing the result. This study is expected to give an overview to Movenpick Resort and Spa Jimbaran of how they can improve aspects that are considered less effective of training program. This also would give input on model to conduct training evaluation basing on participant's reaction, thus they could evaluate their future training with a relevant model.

2. RESEARCH METHOD

The population of this study is all employees of Movenpick Resort and Spa Jimbaran. It means the population is heterogeneous, therefore to specify the sample, it will be applied proportionate stratified random sampling. Stratified sampling is the sampling type where the elements in the population are divided into several groups that are based on its characteristics so it has homogenous data (Leavy, 2017, p.265). This sampling technique applies proportional allocation to keep the size of the sample from different strata, with the same chance to be chosen to represent the stratum. In this study, the stratification consists of 13 strata based on the department. Using Slovin Formula, the sample of this study is 75 employees representing 13 departments; Administration & General (n=1), Talent & Culture (n=1), Sales & Marketing (n=4), Revenue & Reservation (n=1), Finance (n=5), Front Office (n=11), Housekeeping (n=13), Recreation & Activity (n=5), Food & Beverage Service (n=12), Culinary (n=9), Above 11 (n=8), Engineering (n=4), and Security (n=1). Questionnaire was distributed to all 75 employees (response rate 100%, usable rate 100%).

The research instrument of this study is closed questionnaire where respondents only choose the answers that have been provided. The indicators used are related to the effectiveness of the training implementation based on the theory developed by Kirpatrick & Kirpatrick (2007). A validity test is carried out to measure the questionnaire instrument that will be used in this study. The test is carried out using SPSS software. The questionnaire is said to be valid if the value of $r_{table} < r_{count}$. It was found that the value of r_{table} for 30 respondents with a significance level of 0,01 is 0,462 (df = N-2). Through testing that has been done, each question item is worth more than r_{table} with the range 0,643 – 0,937. In other words, $r_{count} > r_{table}$ which means the questionnaire items are valid. To test the reliability of the instrument, the questionnaire is tested with Cronbach Alpha with a minimum Cronbach

Alpha value of 0,7 according to (Taber, 2017). Based on testing that has been done, it was found that the Cronbach Alpha value on this questionnaire is 0,9 which means reliable.

This research used mixed-method analysis, which means both quantitative and qualitative description are conducted. To describe the perception of employees on how the training was held (whether it has fulfilled Kirkpatrick’s Criteria of effective training), a survey through questionnaire was done. To gather further data to analyze what strategy could be performed to continuously establish an effective training program, interview was held to Learning Coordinator of Talent and Culture Department and some of the employees. In addition, the qualitative data is enriched with document study from the file of Talent and Culture Department. The data gathered were both in quantitative and qualitative, in which perception of the employees towards the training was quantified by Likert Scale, and qualitatively through interview result, and any document. To analyze the effectiveness of training program that has been held in Movenpick Resort and Spa Jimbaran, Mean score calculation was held. Moreover, to analyze the strategy could be performed to continuously establish effective program, qualitative description was held.

3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Data Description

The result of the survey collected through a questionnaire is analyzed by calculating the mean score or statistical average first to obtained average value of data which focuses on each indicator. Therefore, the discussion produces 10 mean values which interpreted descriptively to give understanding about the real practice. The data calculation as the result of the survey is summarized in Table 2.

Table 2. Mean Score Data Calculation

No	Indicators	Mean Score
1	Base the program of the needs of the participants	4.31
2	Set learning objectives	4.41
3	Schedule the program at the right time	4.08
4	Hold the program at the right place with the right amenities	4.22
5	Invite the right people to attend	4.35
6	Select effective instructors	4.34
7	Use effective techniques and aids	4.34
8	Accomplish the program objectives	4.30
9	Satisfy the participants	4.13
10	Evaluate the program	4.29
Total Mean Score		4.28

The questionnaire distributed both online and offline contained 20 statement items referred to Kirkpatrick's theory of training effectiveness. Respondents are required to fill in every question and give a value with a rating of 1 (Strongly disagree) into 5 (Strongly agree). In general, overall mean score (4,28) indicates that respondents agree that the training programs have fulfilled the criteria of Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick (2007). It can be seen that the result of calculation by Mean Score formula is obtained the two lowest scores at the criteria number 3 with score 4.08 namely "Schedule the program at the right time" and number 9 with 4.13 namely "Satisfy the participants", this indicates that training program needs improvement on how schedule being set and how the participants satisfied. While the highest score (4.41) is on criteria number 2 "Set learning objectives". To support the quantitative data gathered from questionnaires, interviews also has been conducted to selected informants. The detailed presentation of quantitative and qualitative results can be seen in discussion section.

3.2 Discussion

Base the program of the needs of the participants. Based on Table 2 of employee assessments regarding indicator of base the program of the need of participants, the mean value is 4,31. This value is included in the very good category but the threshold of the low numbers. Analyzing the results of interviews that have been carried out to key informants who directly participated in training by the department, it is found that the material provided is still general, only provide material based on operational work needs and not specifically based on learning needs of participant. Respondents strongly agree that learning material given has adjusted with the learning needs and work needs. Training program is adjusted to the needs of operational work mainly focus on maintaining SOP practices and as refreshments. Confirmed to some departments, learning material have specified on particular section such as Room attendant, Bar, Pastry, Hot Kitchen. However, Security department practices it in general regardless of the section. It may because of related department responsible for security and safety of overall hotel activity. Moreover, some claimed to be bored with learning material and suggest additional material to enrich, as they suggest to add how to make specific interaction with guest, varied animal folding, and paperwork model on responding to a problem to improve competency. In fact, the hotel only fixed on the implementation of training basing corporate standards to account for operational success. Based on the analysis, effectiveness of this indicator outlines very good, where the provision of materials has met the operational needs of participant's abilities coupled with the control from the trainer in

seeing the performance of participants. However, it is said that departmental training has not fulfilled the competency which focusing on learning needs of individual development. Therefore, departmental training team should pay more attention to the need for individual competency enhancement.

Set learning objectives. Setting learning objectives achieves greatest score, respondents strongly agree it has been clearly formulated which leads to gain benefits. As confirmed on interviews with some informant, all agreed that learning objectives are determined based on SOP. Especially practiced by Culinary department which it has identified on lack of employee skills, any complaints, refreshment, and operations adjustment standard in Housekeeping. However, a fact arises on housekeeping department admitted feeling bored by material on repeating standard again and again without knowing who made mistakes, and in Above Eleven department expects new material would be given for the old team. The concern on this aspect as the result of fact on basing on the need of participant as requirement number 1 in Kirkpatrick's theory. In line with the suggestion from informant to give material such as introduction to Accor standard or else to get to know about new corporate. Analysis above indicates that trainer has not yet analyzed more deeply the learning objectives that each quality desires, as proved by giving SOP only for learning material. Hence, the imbalance value occurs because respondents still lack of confidence about method of formulating learning objectives in departmental training, which has been felt that training is provided only to maintain operational standards.

Schedule the program at the right time. Data presented in Table 2 indicates that respondents agree that the chosen time for training does not interfere with working hours and operations, and duration is set correctly. However, from the interview with culinary and housekeeping department admitted that schedule is hard to be set due to day off of participants (not optimal attendance) makes not effectively deliver material and, in some practices, it takes a long duration which affects working hours which bothers fulfillment of daily work assignment. Confirmed to other departments, schedule is set every day routinely during briefing within 10 – 15 minutes or up to 1 hour more even conducted within 3 days in series to discuss same topic. It leads to the fact that some employees are dissatisfied with the schedule due to some departments inconsistently practice the effective scheduling and not considering the characteristics of department. As ascertained by the informant to be adjusting the schedule and duration with the division of tasks and manning. Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick (2007, p.5) states the program should be scheduled in comfortable time especially for the participants, or in turn, the participant's attitude easier to lead to a negative mindset. It has described

the informant's statement about what they feel to join the program so far. The relationship between setting schedule with duration impact on participant satisfaction joining the training program. The implementation is very well conducted because participants learn every day without have to spend a special time 1 hour on a certain day. However, the inconsistency of duration made the participants feel dissatisfied, therefore departmental trainers need to re-analyze more effective and selective on scheduling. Many things certainly need to be considered by recognizing the character of the department itself in terms of job descriptions, and operational tasks, so that can be estimated and control of the implementation of departmental training.

Hold the program at the right place with the right amenities. Data presented on Table 2 shows score which indicates the assessment of respondents towards implementation of training program has reflected Kirkpatrick's theory in better results. From the interview, respondents agree that selection of place has considered being comfortable, accessible, and well equipped with adequate and supportive equipment. As confirmed, it has adjusted with the purpose whether for verbal (in office area) or practical (direct work area). However, constraints faced by Culinary department due to the quality of tools and equipment are not supporting. It becomes a big concern for related departments, which also leads to the result of participant satisfaction. Confirmed to the departmental trainer in Culinary, it is admitted that the equipment does not fulfill the quality of 5-star hotel and has attempted to propose a replacement and purchase new equipment to support the operations as well, but there was no reply. Therefore, it is suggested to keep update the amenities, also considering the budget, as what informant suggests.

Invite the right people to attend. Respondents also strongly agree with people invited are who in accordance with the need for competency improvement and suitable to be joint which can improve performance of participants. As interview with informant, training is attended by employees who are on duty at the time with the material given is general due to inserted in briefing. Also, responds to a lack of understanding and unable to attend by participant is turning to questions and answer sessions, employee's initiative to asking or supervised at operations. Some have had special approached and attention such as reshared material and videotaped. However, informant in Housekeeping department suggested providing copy of material for optimally reach understanding and reach all participants. Based on the analysis, it can be concluded that lack of control over people who do not yet understand the material, and the implementation of control from each department is different. Therefore, to get effectiveness on maximum results, departmental trainers need to note people who have not yet participated to then be given follow-up

actions to ensure they get the same material, whether by gathering them face-to-face or giving material online.

Select effective instructors. Regarding the instructor, the survey reveals that respondents strongly agree that selected trainers are professionals and experts in the field, also can provide motivation for participants. As interviewed, all informants admitted the trainer chosen are supervisor level and higher. However, Above Eleven department has a trainer who is not really mastered due to new to the team, and housekeeping department have had a trainer who is less ability on mastering audience previously. They also suggest to consistently make learning atmosphere not so formal or too serious as long the point is well delivered. The analysis above found that there are trainers who still new and have less ability to master the audience. Without violating the nature and character of each individual who is certainly different, the management both department head and Talent and Culture department who hold responsible of all training program need to consider the effectiveness of trainers. This can be done by providing requirements and training class to become a departmental trainer. By this, the benefits gained also coupled into new knowledge for prospective trainers as self-improvement in the future.

Use effective techniques and aids. On the other hand, strongly agree also given on the use of effective technique and aids utilizing in the program. From the interview, respondents admit those are make easy to understand the material and appropriate with training needs. Confirmed on interview, all states learning techniques are following objective whether theoretically/verbally or practice/demonstration. The aids to support are provided modules, practical tools, printed material, or just oral and role play without requiring any aids. However, informant suggested consistently provide printed material in housekeeping department. it can be said that in general using effective techniques and aids has been implemented well according to the theory. However, there are still deficiencies that need to be considered again. For the obstacles identified, the implementation of the training program can be reviewed concerning the use of techniques and aids by the departmental trainer. The use of printed material to be distributed to participants will be useful for the long term because it is possible to keep.

Accomplish the program objectives. In the aspect of accomplishment program objective, respondents strongly agree that training they have joint makes the work becomes easier and easily to apply learning material in carrying out work. As confirmed, the objectives said to be achieved, the material can be delivered and implemented in the operations very well, also some admit have improvement on skills related job. However, as certain department still face constraints on tools, material, and schedule which makes

objective cannot effectively be accomplished. Behind, FBS and Above Eleven department expressed their hopes of getting development on competency which has not been the focus. This indicates the procurement of facilities and schedule settings affect other aspects of Kirkpatrick's theory. In addition, the focus of learning objectives needs to re-adjusted with personal development. It is suggested to focus on that solve that obstacle first.

Satisfy the participants. Table above indicates that participants agree the program is very interesting during study hours and leave happy impressions that maintain enthusiasm to attend again. As confirmed, most stated satisfied because the benefits are felt from participating, includes get knowledge as part of job, become well known about the good thing to do, and atmosphere created. However, Above Eleven and Culinary department regretted some aspects that not meet their satisfaction in regards with repetition of learning material for old team, schedule set, and low attention of tools and material as facilities of training even for working. Those criteria should be improved as have been previously suggested.

Evaluate the program. Respondents also agree that evaluation is conducted after training is done and given discussion time to evaluate the training. Most stated that evaluation carried out is a question and answer about learned material after training sessions. Culinary department gives questions to do at home, others had practiced asking about obstacles and shortcomings. In fact, Departmental trainer of culinary department admitted that participants freely to giving input about training due to active participants. However, in housekeeping department feedback related participants satisfaction has never been done, which also mostly practice evaluation only on learning process. Informant with some hesitation said that submission of input for program improvement is important, and it should be done.

4. CONCLUSION

The conducted study has mainly focus to analyze the effectiveness of training program and identify strategy that could be performed to continuously establish a training program effectively at Movenpick Resort and Spa Jimbaran. The effectiveness of training program resulted on good score for scheduling, selection of place and amenities, satisfaction of participants, and program evaluation, and the rest have achieved very good score at low number acquisition which led to area for improvement on respective indicator. Some consider the training is enough, already good, even very good, then leads to any suggestion.

The training provided has not touched the need to increase the competence of an individual and expects to get paperwork model responds

to a problem to improve competency. Some expect new material such as an introduction to Accor as the new corporate, how to make attractive interaction with guest, and more innovative learning. Scheduling needs to be adjusted to operations, manning, and division of tasks due inconsistency practice in certain department. Selection of place and amenities becomes a serious obstacle for Culinary Department, and suggested to update the tool and material and considered to the budget for training. Unsatisfaction arises from material, duration, tools, even the atmosphere makes reduces the enthusiasm. Evaluation through feedback is rarely done and not yet become a major consideration, and is admitted that giving feedback and assessment on reaction should be important to improve training implementation.

Lack of control over people who have not understand the material or missed the session is differently practiced, which suggested to provide copy of material for optimally reach on understanding to all participants. The note stressed for trainers who are new and still a lack of consistency in mastering the audience, and suggested to make the training program becomes not too formal. The use of printed material has not been consistent as aids for learning leads to suggestion to provide a print-out material especially in Housekeeping Department. Constraints of amenities in Culinary Department resulting on not effectively achieved the objectives, and suggested to solve it first as the obstacle, in line with the expectation to get improvement on competency is not achieved yet. Through these findings, the hotel can reflect on the result and formulate the effective training program later.

The study has advantages in several aspects, also disadvantages that caused barriers, as the same with some challenges and opportunities. Some advantages are the research uses specific sampling techniques, emphasizes the effectiveness of departmental training as closest form of training and the use of holistic theory by Kirkpatrick. The limitation of this study is due to the presence of COVID-19 pandemic that inhibits almost all activities including the impact on this study. Thus, the disadvantage lies in having to use a higher error margin of 10% due to limited access, time and resources, and data is not equipped with an observation method, also the qualitative interview access is only limited to phone call. However, alternative actions are done to assure the research keep conducted and done according to timeline planned.

Researcher proposed some recommendations for future studies to ensure the selecting of ideal time to conduct research. In addition, using lower error margin for sampling at 5% even 1% to get more significant results. Methodically, it is strongly recommended that subsequent studies be able to conduct direct observations and conduct in-depth interviews directly to obtain optimal data. Besides, subsequent studies can conduct similar studies

on the implementation of training program as a whole in other 5-star hotels to find out comparison study, if necessary, conduct study in a different form by applying the same theory and try another form of evaluation besides reactions such as evaluations of learning, behavior, and results.

REFERENCES

- Acquaful, G., Dedume, V., and Appiah, S. (2016). Staff Training and Development in the Hospitality Industry, Problems, and Challenges – A Comparative Study of SSNIT and KNUST Guest Houses at Kumasi in the Ashanti Region of Ghana. *International Journal of Management and Commerce Innovations*, 3(2), 179-195. <http://www.researchpublish.com>
- Ahammad, S. (2013). Importance of Training in Hotel industry - A case study of the Hilton Hotel, Cyprus. Master. Södertörns University.
- Ahmad, A. and Adamu, M. (2014). The Relationship Between Training Effectiveness And Employee Performance: Mediating Role Of Work Environment. *Asian Academic Research Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities*, 1(21), 230-245. <http://www.asianacademicresearch.org>
- Al-Raggad, M. (2017). The Impact of Training on Improving the Quality of Hotel Services in the Five-Star Hotels A Case Study in the City of Amman, from the Perspective of Workers. *Global Journal of Management and Business Research: A Administration and Management*, 17(1), 97-104.
- Altinay, L., and Paraskevas, A. (2008). Planning research in hospitality and tourism. 1st ed. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann, pp.107-117.
- Bharthavajan, R., Pranavika, N. and Lingappa, S. (2018). A Study On Employee Satisfaction Towards Training Program With Reference To Butterfly Gandhimathi Home Appliances Ltd. *International Journal of Pure and Applied Mathematics*, 119(7), 1685- 1699. <https://ijpam.eu/>
- Buckley, R., and Caple, J. (2009). The Theory and Practice of Training. 6th ed. London: Kogan Page, pp.9 - 22.
- Creswell, J. (2009). Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. 3rd ed. Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications, Inc, pp.3-15.
- Creswell, J., and Creswell, J. (2018). Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. 5th ed. Los Angeles: SAGE, pp.305-308.

- Dawson, C. (2002). *Practical research methods A user-friendly guide to mastering research techniques and projects*. Oxford: How To Books Ltd, p.47.
- Devi, R. and Shaik, N. (2012). Evaluating training & development effectiveness - A measurement model. *Asian Journal Of Management Research*, 2(1), 722- 730. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/340875030>
- Dewi, L. and Kartowagiran, B. (2018). An evaluation of internship program by using Kirkpatrick evaluation model. *Research and Evaluation in Education*, 4(2), 155-163.
- Giangreco, A., Sebastiano, A. and Peccei, R. (2009). Trainees' reactions to training: an analysis of the factors affecting overall satisfaction with training. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 20(1), 96-111. <http://www.tandfonline.com/loi/rijh20>
- Ho, A., Arendt, S., Zheng, T., and Hanisch, K. (2016). Exploration of hotel managers' training evaluation practices and perceptions utilizing Kirkpatrick's and Phillips's models. *Journal of Human Resources in Hospitality & Tourism*, 15(2), 184-208. <http://www.tandfonline.com/loi/whrh20>
- Khalaf, S., Morsy, M., Ahmed, G., and Ali, N. (2016). Impact of Effective Training on Employee Performance in Hotel Establishments. *Journal of Faculty of Tourism and Hotels*, 10(1/2),92-104. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/326740928>
- Kirkpatrick, D., and Kirkpatrick, J. (2007). *Implementing the Four A Practical Guide For Effective Evaluation Of Training Program*. 1st ed. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers, pp.1-107.
- Kothari, C. (2004). *Research Methodology Methods and Technique (Second Revised)*. Daryaganj: New Age International Pvt. Ltd., Publishers, pp.73-134.
- Leavy, P. (2017). *Research Design: Quantitative, Qualitative, Mixed Methods, Arts-Based, And Community-Based Participatory Research Approach*. 2nd ed. New York: he Guilford Press, pp.261-266.
- Mansour, B. J., Naji, A. and Leclerc, A. (2017). The Relationship between Training Satisfaction and the Readiness to Transfer Learning: The Mediating Role of Normative Commitment. *Sustainability*, 9 (5) , 1-14. <https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/>
- Nickson, D. (2007). *Human Resource Management For The Hospitality And Tourism Industries*. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann, pp.7-17.

- Noe, R. (2017). *Employee training and development*. 7th ed. New York: McGraw-Hill Education, pp.8-118.
- Ozturan, M. and Kutlu, B. (2009). Employee satisfaction of corporate e-training programs. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 2(2), pp.5561-5565.
- Singh, Y. (2006). *Fundamental of Research Methodology and Statistics*. Daryaganj: New Age International (P) Ltd., pp.87-224.
- Sini, A., Almansour, Y. and Almansour, B. (2015). The Effect Of E-Banking On Customers' Satisfaction In Financial Services: An Empirical Investigation On Financial Sector In Saudi Arabia. *Journal of Arts, Science & Commerce*, 6(3), 1-11.
- Taber, K. (2017). The Use of Cronbach's Alpha When Developing and Reporting Research Instruments in Science Education. *Research in Science Education*, 48(6), 1273-1296.
- Vanderstoep, S., And Johnston, D. (2009). *Research Methods for Everyday Life Blending Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. San Francisco: John Wiley & Sons, Inc, pp.25- 55.